



UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/488,091	01/18/2000	Kevin R. Lillard	P31.12-0009	3933

7590 07/28/2004
Westman Champlin & Kelly PA
International Centre
900 Second Avenue South
Suite 1600
Minneapolis, MN 55402-3319

EXAMINER

PARK, CHAN S

ART UNIT PAPER NUMBER

2622

DATE MAILED: 07/28/2004

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

Office Action Summary

Application No.

09/488,091

Applicant(s)

LILLAND ET AL.

Examiner

CHAN S PARK

Art Unit

2622

-- The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address --

Period for Reply

A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE 3 MONTH(S) FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.

- Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) days will be considered timely.
- If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.
- Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).

Status

- 1) ☒ Responsive to communication(s) filed on 13 May 2004.
- 2a) ☒ This action is **FINAL**. 2b) ☐ This action is non-final.
- 3) ☐ Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is closed in accordance with the practice under *Ex parte Quayle*, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.

Disposition of Claims

- 4) ☒ Claim(s) 1-22 is/are pending in the application.
- 4a) Of the above claim(s) _____ is/are withdrawn from consideration.
- 5) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are allowed.
- 6) ☒ Claim(s) 1-22 is/are rejected.
- 7) ☐ Claim(s) _____ is/are objected to.
- 8) ☐ Claim(s) _____ are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.

Application Papers

- 9) ☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.
- 10) ☐ The drawing(s) filed on _____ is/are: a) ☐ accepted or b) ☐ objected to by the Examiner.
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).
- 11) ☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.

Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119

- 12) ☐ Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).
- a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:
- ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.
 - ☐ Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. _____.
 - ☐ Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).

* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.

Attachment(s)

- ☐ Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)
- ☐ Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)
- ☐ Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date _____
- ☐ Interview Summary (PTO-413)
Paper No(s)/Mail Date. _____
- ☐ Notice of Informal Patent Application (PTO-152)
- ☐ Other: _____

DETAILED ACTION

Response to Arguments

1. Applicant's response to the Office Action mailed on 2/26/04 was received on 5/13/04.
2. Applicant's arguments filed on 5/13/04 have been fully considered but they are not persuasive.

Referring to page 2, lines 6-9 of the Response, Applicant argued that Owa et al. (hereinafter Owa) fails to disclose *a method of determining a requested print consumable amount that is required to render the print job* that is disclosed in independent claims 1, 15 and 22. Examiner respectfully disagrees with the Applicant. As it was previously noted by Examiner in the Office Action dated 2/26/04, Owa teaches a method of issuing a print job that includes an execution command of a 20-page document in accordance with a user (col. 7, lines 31-32). Additionally, Owa teaches a method of determining, based on the execution command, whether a particular printer can perform the print job (col. 7, lines 35-39). Thus, when the 20-page document print job is inputted by or received from a user, the system inherently determines an amount of print consumable (number of pages or 20 pages in this example) needed to render the print job.

Additionally, please note that the Office considered *In re Donaldson Co.*, 29 USPQ2d 1845 (Fed. Cir. 1994).

3. Therefore, the rejection of **claims 1, 15 and 22**, as cited in the Office Action dated 2/26/04, under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Owa in view of Bradshaw et al. is maintained and repeated in this Office action.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negated by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 1-7, 10-13, 15-18 and 20-22 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Owa et al. U.S. Patent No. 6,348,971 (hereinafter Owa) in view of Bradshaw et al. U.S. Patent No. 6,264,295 (hereinafter Bradshaw).

4. With respect to claim 1, Owa teaches a method for monitoring at least one print consumable of a printing device, comprising:

- a. receiving a print job, wherein the print job includes an image file and a number pages representing the print job is to be printed (col. 4, lines 34-43);
- b. determining a requested print consumable amount defined as an amount (20-page document) of print consumable needed to render the print job (col. 7, lines 31-32);
- c. obtaining a remaining print consumable amount defined as an amount of print consumable that is loaded in the printing device (fig. 4 & col. 4, lines 60-65);
- d. comparing the requested print consumable amount to the remaining print consumable amount (col. 7, lines 23-38);

Art Unit: 2622

- e. interrupting rendering the print job (interrupting the print job by excluding the printers with insufficient remaining papers), prior to rendering the print job, when the requested print consumable amount exceeds the remaining print consumable amount (col. 6, lines 1-5 & col. 7, lines 35-38);
- f. rendering the print job with the printing device when the requested print consumable amount does not exceed the remaining print consumable amount (col. 7, lines 38-42).

Although Owa does not explicitly teach the method of printing multiple copies of the same image file, Examiner takes Official Notice that receiving a print job that includes a copy number representing the number of copies of the images files that are to be printed is well known and conventional in printing art. Further, Owa discloses a method of sorting and stapling. It is well known in the printing art that sorting and stapling methods are commonly used to organize the printed documents after multiple copies are made. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one skill in the art at the time of invention to implement the method of including a copy number representing the number of copies of the image file that are to be printed in the print job.

Owa does not explicitly disclose if the printing device is a compact disc printing device.

Bradshaw, on the other hand, discloses a CD printing device that receives a rectangular image data and converts it into a polar based image data (col. 5, lines 4-5) for printing on a CD or a label for the CD (col. 5, lines 39-41).

Art Unit: 2622

Owa and Bradshaw are analogous art because they are from the same field of endeavor, which is the printing art.

At the time of the invention, it would have been obvious to a person of ordinary skill in the art to combine the method of detecting the remaining print consumable amount and interrupting the print job based on the remaining amount of Owa with the method of printing image data on CD of Bradshaw.

The suggestion for doing so would have been to provide a CD printer that monitors the print consumable such as remaining CD labels or CD's to be printed.

Therefore, it would have been obvious to combine Owa to Bradshaw to obtain the invention as specified in claim 1.

5. With respect to claim 2, Owa further teaches the step warning the user that the print job cannot be completed (col. 6, lines 1-3). The message indicates that none of the printers can complete the print job.

6. With respect to claim 2, Owa further teaches the step warning the user that the print job cannot be completed (col. 6, lines 1-3). The message indicates that none of the printers can complete the print job.

7. With respect to claim 3, Owa further teaches the interrupting step comprising providing the user with an option of adjusting the copy number of the print job (col. 6, lines 3-5).

8. With respect to claim 4, Owa further discloses the print job including a print quality setting (double-sided printing option which reduces the number of papers for the print job) relating to an amount of print consumable used to print

Art Unit: 2622

an image (col. 4, lines 17-26). Additionally, Owa discloses the interrupting step (e) comprising providing the user with the option of adjusting the print quality setting of the print job, whereby the requested print consumable amount can be reduced (col. 6, lines 1-5).

9. With respect to claim 5, Owa teaches the determining step (b) that further comprises determining a single print consumable amount defined as the amount of print consumable needed to print a single copy of the image file, wherein the requested print consumable amount is determined by multiplying the single print consumable amount by the copy number (col. 7, lines 31-32). When user requests one page of image file to be printed, the printer inherently knows that the image file needs one sheet or one paper to render the print job. Thus, when the user requests 20 copies of same image to be printed, the printer inherently determines that it needs 20 sheets to render the print job. Additionally, when double-sided print function is requested on 20-page document, calculating the number of pages to be used in the print job, 10 pages in this case, is a well-known method in printing art.

10. With respect to claim 6, Owa further teaches the monitoring method wherein:

The determining step (b) further comprises calculating a maximum copy number (remaining paper amount inherently represents the maximum copy number) representing a maximum number of copies of the image file that can be printed based upon the remaining print consumable amount (remaining paper amount) and the single print consumable amount (col. 4, lines 60-65).

Art Unit: 2622

The interrupting step (e) comprises providing the user with at least one option selected from the group consisting of:

adjusting the copy number of the print job to the maximum copy number;
and

adjusting the copy number of the print job to a number that is less than the maximum copy number (col. 6, lines 3-5).

The user is given with the option to change the print conditions including the number of print pages. Therefore, adjusting the copy number of the print job as claimed is inherently done based on the user's preference.

11. With respect to claim 7, Owa further teaches the monitoring method wherein the interrupting step (e) comprises providing the user with the option of adjusting the amount of print consumable that is available (col. 6, lines 3-5).

Again, since Owa teaches the method of notifying the user the insufficiency of the remaining amount of papers, the user can choose to either change the print setting or add more papers to the printer. Additionally, after proper adjustments have been made, the updated the status information of the printer (col. 4, lines 13-17), would now show sufficient amount of papers to render the print job.

12. With respect to claim 10, Owa further discloses the monitoring method wherein the interrupting step (e) comprises providing the user with an option of canceling the rendering of the print job (col. 13, lines 1-4).

13. With respect to claim 11, Owa further discloses the monitoring method wherein the interrupting step (e) comprises providing the user with an option of rendering the print job without any adjustments (col. 7, lines 23-47). According

Art Unit: 2622

Owa, when one printer does not have enough papers to render the print job, the system automatically selects another printer to render the print job without any adjustments.

14. With respect to claim 12, Owa further discloses the monitoring method wherein the rendering step (f) further comprises updating the remaining print consumable amount by deducting the requested print consumable amount (col. 4, lines 13-17).

15. With respect to claim 13, Owa further discloses the monitoring method wherein the rendering step (f) comprises:

printing a single copy of the image file;

deducting the single print consumable amount from the remaining print consumable amount (obtaining the most recent information *whenever necessary* in col. 4, lines 13-16); and

repeating the last two printing steps and the deducting step until the print job is completely rendered.

Again, it is commonly known that the conventional printer prints one copy at a time until all print job is completely rendered. Since the status information can be obtained at any given time, it is inherent that single print consumable, a paper, is deducted from the remaining print consumable amount.

16. With respect to claim 15, Owa teaches a method for monitoring at least one print consumable of a printing device, comprising:

Art Unit: 2622

- a. receiving a print job, wherein the print job includes an image file and a number pages representing the print job is to be printed (col. 4, lines 34-43);
- b. determining a single print consumable amount for an image file of the print job defined as an amount of print consumable needed by the printing device to render the image file (col. 7, lines 31-32);
- c. estimating a requested print consumable amount needed to render the print job by multiplying the single print consumable amount by the number of image files that are to be rendered (see the rejection for claim 5);
- d. obtaining a remaining print consumable amount defined as an amount of print consumable that is available to the printing device (fig. 4 & col. 4, lines 60-65);
- e. comparing the requested print consumable amount to the remaining print consumable amount (col. 7, lines 23-38);
- f. interrupting rendering the print job (interrupting the print job by excluding the printers with insufficient remaining papers), prior to rendering the image file, when the requested print consumable amount exceeds the remaining print consumable amount (col. 6, lines 1-5 & col. 7, lines 35-38);
- g. rendering the image file with the printing device when the requested print consumable amount does not exceed the remaining print consumable amount (col. 7, lines 38-42);

Art Unit: 2622

- h. updating the remaining print consumable amount by subtracting the single print consumable amount of the image file (see the rejection for claim 13);
- i. determining whether the remaining print consumable amount has been exhausted (status monitor section that updates the status of remaining paper amount in col. 4, lines 11-13);
- j. interrupting the rendering of the print job (interrupting the print job by excluding the printers with insufficient remaining papers), when the remaining print consumable amount has been exhausted (it is inherent that the printer stops printing since there are no papers);
- k. determining whether all of the image files of the print job have been rendered (col. 7, lines 41-42);
- m. determining a single print consumable amount of another image file of the print job if all of the image files have not been rendered;
- n. rendering the image file (col. 7, lines 38-42); and
- o. returning to step (h).

Although the Owa does not explicitly teach the method of printing multiple copies of the same image file, Examiner takes Official Notice that receiving a print job that includes a copy number representing the number of copies of the images files that are to be printed is well known and conventional in printing art. Further, the reference discloses a method of sorting and stapling. It is well known in the printing art that sorting and stapling methods are commonly used to organize the printed documents after multiple copies are made. Therefore, it

Art Unit: 2622

would have been obvious to one skill in the art at the time of invention to implement the method of including a copy number representing the number of copies of the image file that are to be printed in the print job.

Also, referring to step m, it is inherent that the printer is made to receive other print jobs when one print job is done.

Owa does not explicitly disclose if the printing device is a compact disc printing device.

Bradshaw, on the other hand, discloses a CD printing device that receives a rectangular image data and converts it into a polar based image data (col. 5, lines 4-5) for printing on a CD or a label for the CD (col. 5, lines 39-41).

Owa and Bradshaw are analogous art because they are from the same field of endeavor, which is the printing art.

At the time of the invention, it would have been obvious to a person of ordinary skill in the art to combine the method of detecting the remaining print consumable amount and interrupting the print job based on the remaining amount of Owa with the method of printing image data on CD of Bradshaw.

The suggestion for doing so would have been to provide a CD printer that monitors the print consumable such as remaining CD labels or CD's to be printed.

Therefore, it would have been obvious to combine Owa to Bradshaw to obtain the invention as specified in claim 15.

17. With respect to claim 16, arguments analogous to those presented for claims 6 and 7, are applicable.

Art Unit: 2622

18. With respect to claim 17, Owa further teaches the monitoring method wherein the interrupting step (k) includes providing the user with at least one of a warning that the print job cannot be completed, an option of canceling the print job (col. 13, lines 1-4), an option of adjusting the remaining print consumable amount, and an option of rendering the print job (col. 6, line 3-5).

The user is given with the option to change the print conditions including the number of print pages. Therefore, adjusting the copy number of the print job as claimed is inherently done based on the user's preference.

19. With respect to claim 18, arguments analogous to those presented for claim 4, are applicable.

20. With respect to claim 20, arguments analogous to those presented for claim 15, are applicable.

21. With respect to claim 21, Owa further teaches the monitoring method wherein the image files of the print job relate to addresses (steps S47-S39 in fig. 11 & col. 13, lines 9-14). Owa teaches the method of getting the network addresses of the network printers. Therefore, it would have been obvious that the image file to be printed includes the network address of the selected printer for a proper data transmission. Without the network address, the image file would not be transmitted properly.

Bradshaw teaches the method of rendering the image files onto one of envelopes and labels (col. 5, lines 40-42).

22. With respect to claim 22, Owa reference discloses a system for monitoring print consumable of a printing device, the system comprising:

Art Unit: 2622

a computer having a processor (host computer 1), an I/O port connected to the printing device, and a memory (fig. 2);

a software application (col. 3, lines 30-31) executable by the processor and configured to prepare a print job and to communicate with the printing device, through the I/O port, to render the print job, wherein the print job includes an image file and a copy number representing the number of copies of the image file that are to be printed (col. 4, lines 40-43); and

a print consumable monitoring module configured to:

communicate with the software application and the memory;

maintain a remaining print consumable amount representing the amount of print consumable currently available to the printing device in the memory (col. 4, lines 6-17);

determine a requested print consumable amount defined as an amount of print consumable needed to process the print job (col. 7, lines 31-32); and

compare the remaining print consumable amount to the requested print consumable amount (col. 7, lines 23-38);

whereby the rendering of the print job is interrupted when the requested print consumable amount exceeds the remaining print consumable amount (col. 6, lines 1-5 & col. 7, lines 35-38).

Although Owa does not explicitly teach the method of printing multiple copies of the same image file, Examiner takes Official Notice that receiving a print job that includes a copy number representing the number of copies of the images files that are to be printed is well known and conventional in printing art.

Art Unit: 2622

Further, the reference discloses a method of sorting and stapling. It is well known in the printing art that sorting and stapling methods are commonly used to organize the printed documents after multiple copies are made. Therefore, it would have been obvious to one skill in the art at the time of invention to implement the method of including a copy number representing the number of copies of the image file that are to be printed in the print job.

Also, referring to step m, it is inherent that the printer is made to receive other print jobs when one print job is done.

Owa does not explicitly disclose if the printing device is a compact disc printing device.

Bradshaw reference, on the other hand, discloses a CD printing device that receives a rectangular image data and converts it into a polar based image data (col. 5, lines 4-5) for printing on a CD or a label for the CD (col. 5, lines 39-41).

Owa and Bradshaw are analogous art because they are from the same field of endeavor, which is the printing art.

At the time of the invention, it would have been obvious to a person of ordinary skill in the art to combine the method of detecting the remaining print consumable amount and interrupting the print job based on the remaining amount of Owa with the method of printing image data on CD of Bradshaw.

The suggestion for doing so would have been to provide a CD printer that monitors the print consumable such as remaining CD labels or CD's to be printed.

Art Unit: 2622

Therefore, it would have been obvious to combine Owa to Bradshaw to obtain the invention as specified in claim 20.

Claims 8 and 9 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over the combination of Owa and Bradshaw as applied to claim 7 above, and further in view of Itoh et al. U.S. Patent No. 6,603,567 (hereinafter Itoh).

23. With respect to claim 8, the combination of Owa and Bradshaw teaches all the limitations cited in claim 7 but it fails to teaches that the print consumable is stored in a print cartridge.

Itoh, on the other hand, discloses a first cartridge for storing printing sheets (fig. 1) wherein the cartridge receives a filename for the first print cartridge (col. 5, lines 53-61) and saves the remaining print consumable amount of the first print cartridge in a memory (EEPROM 36) under the filename (col. 5, lines 42-52). It further teaches method of replacing the first print cartridge with a second print cartridge (new cartridge) having a remaining print consumable amount, and resetting the remaining print consumable amount to the remaining print consumable amount of the second cartridge.

It should be noted that each cartridge is distinct from one another since the cartridges are replaceable and the number of remaining pages and the size of recording paper in the cartridge are different. Therefore, when a new cartridge is installed to the printer (fig. 2) the central processing unit 31 reads all the information according to the present cartridge (col. 5, lines 8-10, 23-25). Additionally, since the cartridge is removable from the printer to be replaced with

Art Unit: 2622

another new cartridge, the CPU 31 will inherently and automatically erase or reset the old cartridge information and read the new remaining print consumable amount, printing sheets, from the EEPROM in the newly installed cartridge.

Owa, Bradshaw, and Itoh are analogous art because they are from the same field of endeavor, which is the printing art.

At the time of the invention, it would have been obvious to a person of ordinary skill in the art to combine the method of monitoring print consumable amount of a CD printing device taught by Owa and Bradshaw with the method of using a cartridge for storing printing sheets taught by Itoh.

The suggestion for doing so would have been to provide a CD printer with a container or cartridge for storing recording medium that is capable of carrying out the information regarding the recording medium to the printer.

Therefore, it would have been obvious to combine all three references to obtain the invention as specified in claim 8.

24. With respect to claim 9, arguments analogous to those presented for claim 8, are applicable.

Claim 14 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over the combination of Owa and Bradshaw as applied to claim 1 above, and further in view of Springett U.S. Patent No. 5,636,032.

25. With respect to claim 14, the combination of Owa and Bradshaw teaches all the limitations of claim 1, but it does not explicitly teach the print consumable being one of ink, toner, colored dye ribbon, and wax based ribbon.

Art Unit: 2622

Springett, on the other hand, teaches the method of monitoring the amount of ink remaining, method of calculating amount of ink utilized in printing a single copy, and method of determining the number of copies can be printed (col.4, lines 32-41, col. 5, lines 23-43).

Since Springett, the same field of endeavor of printing art, teaches the method of calculating amount of ink to the render the print job based on the amount of ink used in single copy job, it would have been obvious to implement the method of monitoring ink usage of Springett to the method of monitoring paper amount of combination of Owa and Bradshaw.

The suggestion would have been to notify or warn the user if the print job can be completely rendered based on the remaining ink amount as well as the remaining paper amount.

Therefore, it would have been obvious to combine three references to obtain the invention as specified in claim 14.

Claim 19 is rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over the combination of Owa and Bradshaw as applied to claim 15 above, and further in view of Springett.

26. With respect to claim 19, arguments analogous to those presented for claim 14, are applicable.

Conclusion

27. **THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL.** Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

28. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to CHAN S PARK whose telephone number is (703) 305-2448. The examiner can normally be reached on M-F 8am-4:30pm.


If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Edward Coles can be reached on (703) 305-4712. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Art Unit: 2622

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see <http://pair-direct.uspto.gov>. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

Chan S. Park
Examiner
Art Unit 2622

csp
July 14, 2004


EDWARD COLES
SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER
TECHNOLOGY CENTER 2600